



SAN FRANCISCO PLANNING DEPARTMENT

Planning Commission Resolution No. 20571

HEARING DATE: NOVEMBER 21, 2019

Project Name: Calle 24 Special Area Design Guidelines
Case Number: 2018-003800CWP
Staff Contact: John M. Francis, Senior Planner & Urban Designer
Citywide Planning Division
john.francis@sfgov.org, (415) 575-9147
Reviewed By: Aaron Starr, Manager of Legislative Affairs
aaron.starr@sfgov.org, (415) 558-6362

1650 Mission St.
Suite 400
San Francisco,
CA 94103-2479

Reception:
415.558.6378

Fax:
415.558.6409

Planning
Information:
415.558.6377

RESOLUTION ADOPTING THE CALLE 24 SPECIAL AREA DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR ALL PROJECTS IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL 1, 2, AND 3 ZONING DISTRICTS (NC-1, NC-2, AND NC-3), THE 24TH STREET-MISSION NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL TRANSIT ZONING DISTRICT (24TH-MISSION NCT), AND MISSION STREET NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL TRANSIT ZONING DISTRICT (MISSION NCT) THAT ARE WITHIN OR DIRECTLY ADJACENT TO THE CALLE 24 SPECIAL USE DISTRICT; ADOPTING FINDINGS, INCLUDING ENVIRONMENTAL FINDINGS, AND FINDINGS OF CONSISTENCY WITH THE GENERAL PLAN AND PLANNING CODE SECTION 101.1.

WHEREAS, in 2014 the Board of Supervisors approved Resolution 168-14 establishing the Calle 24 Latino Cultural District, which recognized the unique cultural contributions of the Latino community to the Mission District, particularly in the blocks south of 22nd Street; and

WHEREAS, in 2017 the Board of Supervisors approved legislation establishing the Calle 24 Special Use District (SUD), which included controls intended to support the economic vitality of the Calle 24 Latino Cultural District by helping to address the challenge of small business displacement, and which called for the adoption of a set of design guidelines to support the policy goals and objectives articulated in the Calle 24 Latino Cultural District and the SUD related to the preservation of neighborhood character and recognition of Latino cultural heritage on 24th Street; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Department, in response, has developed the Calle 24 Special Area Design Guidelines (SADGs)—covering the topics of Site Design, Architecture, and Public Realm—through an intensive analysis of existing neighborhood form and character to help retain the character-defining physical elements of the Latino Cultural District while permitting growth that is compatible with those elements; and

WHEREAS, the SADGs support the built environment goals and values found in the General Plan, including that new projects be contextual and reflect existing neighborhood architecture and urban patterns; contribute high quality design to the city based on best professional standards and practices;

enhance neighborhood uniqueness and cultural character; and support an active pedestrian environment and human-scaled design; and

WHEREAS, the SADGs support and complement the City's Urban Design Guidelines (UDGs) by providing neighborhood-specific design guidance tailored to local context in the Calle 24 neighborhood and supersede the UDGs where they conflict; and

WHEREAS, the SADGs will not modify any existing design guidelines or the General Plan;

WHEREAS, the Planning Department worked extensively with City agencies, neighborhood organizations, a Calle 24 SADG Community Working Group, and members of the public over nearly two years to refine the process, applicability, and content of the SADGs and revised all three in response to feedback offered and requested; and

WHEREAS, the proposed guidelines are not defined as a project under the California Environmental Quality Act Sections 15378 and 15060(c)(2) because they do not intensify development or change or affect zoning or transportation in the built environment; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission has heard and considered the testimony presented to it at the public hearing and has further considered written materials and oral testimony presented on behalf of Department staff and other interested parties beginning with a Planning Commission informational on July 18, 2019; and

WHEREAS, all pertinent documents may be found in the files of the Department, as the Custodian of Records, at 1650 Mission Street, Suite 400, San Francisco; and

MOVED, that the Planning Commission hereby adopts the proposed Calle 24 Special Area Design Guidelines (included as Exhibit A) for application in Neighborhood Commercial 1, 2, and 3 zoning districts (NC-1, NC-2, AND NC-3), the 24th Street-Mission Neighborhood Commercial Transit zoning district (24th-Mission NCT), and the Mission Street Neighborhood Commercial Transit zoning district (Mission NCT) that are within or directly adjacent to the Calle 24 Special Use District (as designated in Exhibit B).

The effective date for application of the Urban Design Guidelines will be for site permits or project applications submitted on or after December 1, 2019 in applicable areas.

FINDINGS

Having reviewed the materials identified in the preamble above, and having heard all testimony and arguments, this Commission finds, concludes, and determines as follows:

1. **General Plan Compliance.** The proposed Calle 24 Special Area Design Guidelines are consistent with the following Objectives and Policies of the General Plan:

URBAN DESIGN ELEMENT

OBJECTIVE 1

EMPHASIS OF THE CHARACTERISTIC PATTERN WHICH GIVES TO THE CITY AND ITS NEIGHBORHOODS AN IMAGE, A SENSE OF PURPOSE, AND A MEANS OF ORIENTATION.

Policy 1.5

Emphasize the special nature of each district through distinctive landscaping and other features.

The proposed Special Area Design Guidelines (SADGs) A3.2 ("Articulate Buildings with Elements Commonly Expressed in the Calle 24 District") and A3.4 ("Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor") require projects to emphasize the unique nature of the Calle 24 district by preserving and highlighting architectural features and using materials and colors that are common to the area.

OBJECTIVE 2

CONSERVATION OF RESOURCES WHICH PROVIDE A SENSE OF NATURE, CONTINUITY WITH THE PAST, AND FREEDOM FROM OVERCROWDING.

Policy 2.4

Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

The proposed SADG A3.1 requires projects to "Preserve and Adaptively Reuse Architecturally Significant Buildings" and for projects adjacent to significant buildings to defer to and complement older buildings in their expression and scale.

Policy 2.5

Use care in remodeling of older buildings, in order to enhance rather than weaken the original character of such buildings.

The proposed SADG A3.1 requires projects to "Preserve and Adaptively Reuse Architecturally Significant Buildings" and for the craft and detail inherent to older buildings to be recognized and preserved.

Policy 2.6

Respect the character of older development nearby in the design of new buildings.

The proposed SADGs S2.1, S5.1, A3.1, A3.2, and A3.4 require projects to "Sculpt the Massing of New Buildings to Relate to the Scale of Adjacent Buildings;" "Respect the Rhythm, Patterns, and Spacing of Existing Buildings in Contributing to the Streetwall;" "Preserve and Adaptively Reuse Architecturally Significant Buildings;" "Articulate Buildings with Elements Commonly Expressed in the Calle 24 District" and; "Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor", respectively, all to foster neighborhood development that is compatible with the character of existing older development in scale and detailing and maintains a consistent sense of enclosure at the street level.

OBJECTIVE 3

MODERATION OF MAJOR NEW DEVELOPMENT TO COMPLEMENT THE CITY PATTERN, THE RESOURCES TO BE CONSERVED, AND THE NEIGHBORHOOD ENVIRONMENT.

Policy 3.1

Promote harmony in the visual relationships and transitions between new and older buildings.

The proposed SADGs S2.1, S5.1, A3.1, A3.2, and A3.4 require projects to “Sculpt the Massing of New Buildings to Relate to the Scale of Adjacent Buildings;” “Respect the Rhythm, Patterns, and Spacing of Existing Buildings in Contributing to the Streetwall;” “Preserve and Adaptively Reuse Architecturally Significant Buildings;” “Articulate Buildings with Elements Commonly Expressed in the Calle 24 District” and; “Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor,” respectively, all to foster neighborhood development that is compatible with the scale, form, materiality, and proportion of existing older development.

OBJECTIVE 4

IMPROVEMENT OF THE NEIGHBORHOOD ENVIRONMENT TO INCREASE PERSONAL SAFETY, COMFORT, PRIDE AND OPPORTUNITY.

Policy 4.12

Install, promote and maintain landscaping in public and private areas.

The proposed SADG P7.7 requires projects to “Incorporate Best Practices with Street Trees to Support Health and Livability” by encouraging the installation and proper maintenance of street trees and the careful selection of tree species that are suitable for the Calle 24 district.

Policy 4.13

Improve pedestrian areas by providing human scale and interest.

The proposed SADGs A4.1, A8.1, A8.2, P3.2, P5.1, and P6.1 require projects to treat blank walls “to Minimize their Impact on the Public Realm;” “Compose Storefronts to Maintain the Pattern of Pedestrian-Scaled Facade Elements;” “Use Windows and Doors that Promote Transparency and Encourage a Strong Connection Between Public and Private Realm;” “Design Sidewalks to Promote Art and Cultural Character Through Outdoor Seating and Furnishings;” “Highlight Alleys as Pedestrian-Oriented Spaces;” and “Incorporate Corner Bulb-Outs or Placitas at Intersections,” respectively, all to foster neighborhood development that is makes walking more pleasurable and comfortable.

Policy 4.15

Protect the livability and character of residential properties from the intrusion of incompatible new buildings.

The proposed SADGs S2.1, S5.1, A3.1, A3.2, and A3.4 require projects to “Sculpt the Massing of New Buildings to Relate to the Scale of Adjacent Buildings;” “Respect the Rhythm, Patterns, and Spacing of Existing Buildings in Contributing to the Streetwall;” “Preserve and Adaptively Reuse Architecturally Significant Buildings;” “Articulate Buildings with Elements Commonly Expressed in the Calle 24 District” and; “Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor,”

respectively, all to foster neighborhood development that retains human scale by maintaining established building lines and consistent/unbroken retail frontages and utilizing fine-grain texture and detail at lower levels.

COMMERCE AND INDUSTRY ELEMENT

OBJECTIVE 6

MAINTAIN AND STRENGTHEN VIABLE NEIGHBORHOOD COMMERCIAL AREAS EASILY ACCESSIBLE TO CITY RESIDENTS.

Policy 6.7

Promote high quality urban design on commercial streets.

The proposed SADGs S2.1, S5.1, A3.1, A3.2, and A3.4 require projects to “Sculpt the Massing of New Buildings to Relate to the Scale of Adjacent Buildings;” “Respect the Rhythm, Patterns, and Spacing of Existing Buildings in Contributing to the Streetwall;” “Preserve and Adaptively Reuse Architecturally Significant Buildings;” “Articulate Buildings with Elements Commonly Expressed in the Calle 24 District” and; “Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor”, respectively, all to foster neighborhood development that contributes to San Francisco’s pattern of active, small-scale neighborhood commercial districts and that is compatible with the scale, orientation, proportions, and texture of existing commercial development.

ARTS ELEMENT

OBJECTIVE I-1

RECOGNIZE THE ARTS AS NECESSARY TO THE QUALITY OF LIFE FOR ALL SEGMENTS OF SAN FRANCISCO.

Policy I-1.1

Promote inclusion of artistic considerations in local decision-making.

The proposed SADGs A3.4, A4.1, P3.1, and P3.2 require projects to “Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor;” treat blank walls to “Minimize their Impact on the Public Realm;” “Promote Murals to Celebrate Latino Cultural Heritage, Highlight Architecture, and Accent Blank Walls that Face the Public Right-of-Way,” and; “Design Sidewalks to Promote Art and Cultural Character Through Outdoor Seating and Furnishings,” respectively, all to encourage the incorporation of art into the design of new building projects.

OBJECTIVE II-2

SUPPORT ARTS AND CULTURAL PROGRAMS WHICH ADDRESS THE NEEDS OF DIVERSE POPULATIONS.

Policy II-2.3

Continue to increase City support for organizations and developing institutions which reflect the diverse cultural traditions of the San Francisco population.

The proposed SADG P3.1 encourages incorporation of art that celebrates Latino cultural heritage into the design of new building projects and encourages project sponsors to work with local artists and organizations to commission new artwork.

MISSION AREA PLAN

OBJECTIVE 3.1

PROMOTE AN URBAN FORM THAT REINFORCES THE MISSION'S DISTINCTIVE PLACE IN THE CITY'S LARGER FORM AND STRENGTHENS ITS PHYSICAL FABRIC AND CHARACTER.

Policy 3.1.9

Preserve notable landmarks and areas of historic, architectural or aesthetic value, and promote the preservation of other buildings and features that provide continuity with past development.

The proposed SADG A3.1 requires projects to "Preserve and Adaptively Reuse Architecturally Significant Buildings."

OBJECTIVE 3.2

PROMOTE AN URBAN FORM AND ARCHITECTURAL CHARACTER THAT SUPPORTS WALKING AND SUSTAINS A DIVERSE, ACTIVE AND SAFE PUBLIC REALM.

Policy 3.2.1

Require high quality design of street-facing building exteriors.

The proposed SADGs S2.1, S5.1, A3.2, and A3.4 require projects to "Sculpt the Massing of New Buildings to Relate to the Scale of Adjacent Buildings;" "Respect the Rhythm, Patterns, and Spacing of Existing Buildings in Contributing to the Streetwall;" "Articulate Buildings with Elements Commonly Expressed in the Calle 24 District" and; "Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor", respectively, all to foster neighborhood development that contributes to the Mission's pattern of active, small-scale neighborhood commercial districts and that is compatible with the scale, orientation, proportions, and texture of existing commercial development.

Policy 3.2.2

Make ground floor retail and PDR uses as tall, roomy and permeable as possible.

The proposed SADG A8.2 requires projects to "Use Windows and Doors that Promote Transparency and Encourage a Strong Connection Between Public and Private Realm," thereby fostering a highly permeable ground floor retail environment.

Policy 3.2.4

Strengthen the relationship between a building and its fronting sidewalk.

The proposed SADGs A4.1, A8.1, A8.2, and P3.2 require projects to treat blank walls "to Minimize their Impact on the Public Realm;" "Compose Storefronts to Maintain the Pattern of Pedestrian-Scaled Facade Elements;" "Use Windows and Doors that Promote Transparency and Encourage a Strong Connection Between Public and Private Realm," and; "Design Sidewalks to Promote Art and Cultural Character

Through Outdoor Seating and Furnishings," respectively, all to foster neighborhood development that provides a strong relationship between ground floor uses and the adjacent public realm.

Policy 3.2.8

Recognize the distinctive Mission murals and expand the opportunities for new murals as well as other public art by providing space such as visible and publicly accessible walls in new construction adjacent to or near the murals to allow for these art traditions to thrive and continue, and by ensuring new construction does not obstruct, demolish, damage or otherwise diminish the Mission murals and other public art.

The proposed SADGs A4.1 and P3.1 require projects to treat blank walls "to Minimize their Impact on the Public Realm" and "Promote Murals to Celebrate Latino Cultural Heritage, Highlight Architecture, and Accent Blank Walls that Face the Public Right-of-Way," respectively, which foster opportunities for new murals and other art and preserve existing art.

OBJECTIVE 7.3

REINFORCE THE IMPORTANCE OF THE MISSION AS THE CENTER OF LATINO LIFE IN SAN FRANCISCO.

Policy 7.3.3

Protect and support Latino and other culturally significant local business, structures, property and institutions in the Mission.

The proposed SADGs A3.4, A7.1, A8.3, and P3.1 require projects to "Incorporate Art, Textures, Colors, and Materials that Have a Strong Precedent on the Corridor;" "Use a Variety of Signage to Maintain Diversity of Character;" "Utilize Bulkheads to Provide Articulation and Avoid Overly Glassy Storefronts" and; "Promote Murals to Celebrate Latino Cultural Heritage, Highlight Architecture, and Accent Blank Walls that Face the Public Right-of-Way," respectively, all to foster development that is supportive of Latino and other culturally significant architecture, businesses, and institutions.

2. **Planning Code Section 101 Findings.** The proposed amendments to the Planning Code are consistent with the eight Priority Policies set forth in Section 101.1(b) of the Planning Code in that:

1. That existing neighborhood-serving retail uses be preserved and enhanced and future opportunities for resident employment in and ownership of such businesses enhanced;

The proposed SADGs would enhance neighborhood-serving retail by retaining and supporting the maintenance of its use and built environment character.

2. That existing housing and neighborhood character be conserved and protected in order to preserve the cultural and economic diversity of our neighborhoods;

The proposed SADGs would enhance the retention and maintenance of neighborhood character by requiring that new projects be compatible with neighborhood characteristics at the site design, architecture, and public realm scales.

3. That the City's supply of affordable housing be preserved and enhanced;

The proposed SADGs would not have an adverse effect on the City's supply of affordable housing.

4. That commuter traffic not impede MUNI transit service or overburden our streets or neighborhood parking;

The proposed SADGs would not result in commuter traffic impeding MUNI transit service or overburdening the streets or neighborhood parking.

5. That a diverse economic base be maintained by protecting our industrial and service sectors from displacement due to commercial office development, and that future opportunities for resident employment and ownership in these sectors be enhanced;

The proposed SADGs would not cause displacement of the industrial or service sectors due to office development, and future opportunities for resident employment or ownership in these sectors would not be impaired.

6. That the City achieve the greatest possible preparedness to protect against injury and loss of life in an earthquake;

The proposed SADGs would not have an adverse effect on City's preparedness against injury and loss of life in an earthquake.

7. That the landmarks and historic buildings be preserved;

The proposed SADGs would not have an adverse effect on the City's Landmarks and historic buildings.

8. That our parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas be protected from development;

The proposed SADGs would not have an adverse effect on the City's parks and open space and their access to sunlight and vistas.

3. The application of the SADGs will support neighborhood compatibility and encourage the use of best professional design practices and standards for projects in Neighborhood Commercial 1, 2, and 3 Zoning Districts (NC-1, NC-2, and NC-3), in the 24th Street-Mission Neighborhood Commercial Transit Zoning District (24th-Mission NCT), and Mission Street Neighborhood Commercial Transit Zoning District (Mission NCT) that are within or directly adjacent to the Calle 24 Special Use District.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Commission hereby ADOPTS the proposed Calle 24 Special Area Design Guidelines as described in this Resolution.

I hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was adopted by the Commission at its meeting on November 21, 2019.



Jonas P. Ionin
Commission Secretary

AYES: Melgar, Koppel, Diamond, Johnson, Richards

NOES: None

ABSENT: Moore, Fung

ADOPTED: November 21, 2019