

Advisory Council Meeting Summary DRAFT
November 30, 2021, 9:00am – 11:00am

Council Members Present in person at 49th South Van Ness: Norma Garcia, Raquel Redondiez, Mary Travis-Allen, Ben Wong, Del Seymour

Council Members Present online: Lara Kiswani, Malcolm Yeung,

Council Members Absent: Majeid Crawford, Tiffany Carter, Mahsa Hakimi

City Staff Present: Rich Hillis (Planning Director), Miriam Chion, Claudia Flores, Maia Small, Kamene Ogidi

Facilitator: Ben Wong

Topic: This meeting was focused on a presentation of housing strategies developed in the Equity Council's Housing Stability working group and proposed changes in the Planning Budget and Work Program.

1. Opening

Ben welcomed the Equity Council to the hybrid meeting. Ben asked the Council about meeting in the mornings. Feedback is that mornings work well, as it allays traveling safety concerns for senior members of the Council. Some Council members communicate that morning meetings may require adjustments to personal meetings, but that they are happy to make accommodations for those who need it.

2. Presentation of Housing Strategies by the Housing Stability Working Group

Norma presented the first portion of the Housing Strategies from the Housing Stability working group. Her presentation introduces four areas in which equity can be operationalized through housing strategies: Reparative Housing, Housing Proximity, Community Stabilization, Wealth and Homeownership. Each of these recommended strategies are further dissected into associated Housing Policies and recommended Housing Delivery – the method by which to achieve the policy. The recommended housing strategies are identified according to implementation timelines including short-term and long-term, and flagged if they require structural change.

Housing Stability Strategies

Goals	Delivery	
Housing Policies	Housing Access and Funding	Housing Data and Accountability
<p>Reparative Housing Prioritize return of displaced communities</p> <p>Community Stabilization</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Expand resources for housing preservation and to retain low-income and households and communities of color Protect communities of color, including residents, cultural institutions and landmarks Increase community capacity for housing development Create community strategies to integrate housing, businesses, jobs, parks, and services <p>Wealth Building</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Prioritize homeownership programs for Black and American Indian and other households of color Identify housing opportunities in high-resource neighborhoods 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Prioritize return of displaced communities in collaboration with MOHCD Create community strategies to integrate housing, businesses, jobs, parks, and services Increase community capacity for housing development 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop a housing portal to access and track communities served by income, race and location Track community impacts and accountability for projects Prepare data and historic context statements addressing public housing and redlining

Raquel presented the second portion of the Housing Strategies from the Housing Stability working group. Specifically, she presented on Housing Access and Funding delivery.

Strategies by Subject

Housing Access and Funding - Efforts
<p>Prioritize return of displaced communities in collaboration with MOHCD</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Extend Certificate of preference to families Expand mixed-use site acquisition for very low income Build four new affordable housing projects in low density, high resource neighborhoods by 2025 Create pilot housing reparations financing program <p>Create community strategies to integrate housing, businesses, jobs, parks, and services</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Complete Community Strategies or CHES processes for four communities by 2025 Mixed-use small sites program and acquisition <p>Increase community capacity for housing development</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Funding for community and development capacity building Support co-ops and land trusts

Strategies by Subject

Housing Data and Accountability - Efforts

Develop a housing portal to access and track communities served by income, race and location

- Demonstrate change in ratio of affordable housing tenants by race
- Reverse decline of Black and American Indian population
- Expand DAHLIA to include all housing services and complete data tracking by 2023

Track community impacts and accountability for projects

- Expand housing portal to track approved projects
- Create monitoring of community and city agreements and requirements

Prepare data and historic context statements addressing public housing and redlining

- Complete San Francisco Oral and Documented History projects of Redevelopment by 2023.

3. Discussion

Some Council members feel that framing affordable housing and housing access strategies according to access for communities of color or low-income communities, is a reproduction of old thinking by the City. That low-income communities of color should not be limited, due to the location of affordable housing, to live only in low-income communities of color neighborhoods. Council members believe that the lack of housing choice for low-income communities of color points to a wealth equity issue. Some Council members feel there is a need to respond to the current crisis of displacement to stabilize existing communities.

Some Council members pointed to historical policies including the Termination Policy and Indian Relocation Acts, and events including stolen indigenous land and stolen labor which have undermined wealth building for communities of color. Some Council members noted that communities of color struggle to compete with corporate entities that buy up commercial properties, unable to start businesses and build wealth.

Some Council members reflected on home ownership as an opportunity for wealth building, while others believe that San Francisco is at a crossroads, and that wealth building is not possible through affordable home ownership opportunities including Below Market Rate (BMR) homes or cooperative home ownership models. Some Council members likened affordable homes to leasing, believing that it is too difficult to gain equity through affordable home ownership opportunities.

Council members mentioned challenges, current and historical, that are displacing community members. Displacement, alongside housing choice, were framed as an outcome of wealth inequity.

Some Council members believe that it is necessary to make progress in the short-term addressing the housing crisis, as well as longer-term challenges, addressing root systemic issues which underpin overall wealth building and housing access. Council members also feel that it is important to achieve something substantial and not reactionary during their tenure on the Equity Council. Council members feel that the work isn't simply to recognize the harm of the past but to stop the harm now.

Council members addressed both reduction in luxury housing and the true affordability of affordable housing as obstacles to housing access. Some Council members believe that, to address past and current harm, the city should stop building luxury housing or that luxury housing should be deprioritized. Some Council members feel that even affordable housing is no longer affordable to very low-income populations, and that that resources should be focused on affordability to this population. Some Council members noted that all options should be grounded by the presence of material constraints, and that Council conversations should be focused on achievable goals, rather than large, systemic issues.

Some Council members believe that the City should expand beyond Certificate of Preference, and pursue fair housing with the City Attorney.

Miriam Chion suggested that inter-agency collaboration is key to addressing these issues, and that the Planning team would work to bring leadership from the Office of Economic and Workforce Development and the Mayor's Office of Housing to the January meeting.

Some Council members highlighted the pandemic as a parallel event impacting potential for wealth-building and moves toward equitable housing access. A Council member noted that during the pandemic, storefronts were purposely left vacant by owners who are waiting until rents increased to rent out space, demonstrating a pattern in which low-income communities barred from access certain assets or paths to wealth building. Additionally, another Council member shared that since the pandemic has impacted the Planning Department's financial capacity, it is necessary to ensure that the changes toward equity are permanent, and cannot be undone due to limited Department funding. Therefore, ensuring that efforts toward housing access and housing choice for low-income communities of color are not tokenistic.

Miriam Chion pointed to the Housing Element as another parallel event and opportunity for the Equity Council's work to be integrated into long-lasting policy.

A Council member asked if the Council could see the demographics of employees hired since the first convening of the Council. Director Hillis agrees with transparency, stating that this information, along with promotion or other jobs demographics, can be shared with the Equity Council (note that this information has to be presented in a way that it protects the privacy of individual employees so I will be shared in a way that complies with this).

The Council addressed the need for youth access to planning jobs, commenting that youth aren't drawn to planning as a profession because of limited representation. A Council member noted that it is important that community members and leaders plant seeds within their communities that would yield interest and awareness of planning as an option. And, that this work of seeding interest goes hand-in-

hand with Planning Department's committed efforts to build a pipeline from communities of color to the Planning Department.

4. Presentation of Planning Budget and Work Program

Miriam Chion and Director Rich Hillis present changes to the proposed fiscal year 2022-2023 and FY 2023-24 Planning Budget, work program, and interagency policies.

5. Closing

Oscar Grande resigned in-person due to his offer of employment with the City of San Francisco.

6. Next Steps

Miriam Chion asked for volunteers to help with the process to fill the Equity Council position left by Oscar Grande's departure and the hire of a new Community Engagement Manager.

Meeting End