Supervisors Kim, Breed, Campos BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

[Planning Code - Market Street Masonry Historic District]

Ordinance amending the Planning Code, by adding a new Appendix M to Article 10 (Preservation of Historical, Architectural, and Aesthetic Landmarks), to create the Market Street Masonry Historic District, a discontiguous landmark historic district; and making findings, including environmental findings, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and Planning Code, Section 101.1(b).

NOTE:

Additions are <u>single-underline italics Times New Roman</u>; deletions are <u>strike-through italics Times New Roman</u>. Board amendment additions are <u>double-underlined</u>; Board amendment deletions are <u>strikethrough normal</u>.

Be it ordained by the People of the City and County of San Francisco:

Section 1. Findings. The Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco hereby finds and determines that:

- (a) Historic Preservation Commission Findings. On September 19, 2012, at a duly noticed public hearing, the Historic Preservation Commission in Resolution No. 690 found that the proposed Planning Code amendments contained in this ordinance were consistent with the City's General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b) and recommended that the Board of Supervisors adopt the proposed amendments. A copy of said Resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 121004.
- (b) Planning Commission Findings. On September 20, 2012, at a duly noticed public hearing, the Planning Commission in Resolution No. 18707 found that the proposed Planning Code amendments contained in this ordinance were consistent with the City's General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b). In addition, the Planning Commission recommended that the Board of Supervisors adopt the proposed Planning Code

amendments. A copy of said Resolution is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 121004 and is incorporated herein by reference.

- (c) The Board finds that the proposed Planning Code amendments contained in this ordinance are on balance consistent with the City's General Plan and with Planning Code Section 101.1(b) for the reasons set forth in both Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 690 and Planning Commission Resolution No. 18707 and their associated staff reports, which reasons are incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.
- (d) Pursuant to Planning Code Section 302, the Board finds that the proposed ordinance will serve the public necessity, convenience and welfare for the reasons set forth in Historic Preservation Commission Resolution No. 690 and Planning Commission Resolution No. 18707 and their associated staff reports, which reasons are incorporated herein by reference as though fully set forth.
- (e) Environmental Findings. The Planning Department has determined that the actions contemplated in this Ordinance are exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (California Public Resources Code section 21000 et seq.) (CEQA). Said determination is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 121004 and is incorporated herein by reference.

Section 2. The San Francisco Planning Code is hereby amended by amending Article 10 to add a new Appendix M, to read as follows:

## APPENDIX M TO ARTICLE 10

#### MARKET STREET MASONRY HISTORIC DISTRICT

- Sec. 1. Findings and Purposes.
- Sec. 2. Designation.
- Sec. 3. Location And Boundaries.

1	Sec. 4. Relation To Planning Code And The Provisions Of The Charter Of The City And County Of
2	San Francisco.
3	Sec. 5. Statement Of Significance.
4	Sec. 6. Significance Of Individual Buildings To The Landmark District.
5	Sec. 7. Features Of The District And Existing Buildings.
6	Sec. 8. Review Standards For Certificates Of Appropriateness
7	
8	SEC. 1. FINDINGS AND PURPOSES.
9	The Board of Supervisors hereby finds that the area known and described in this ordinance
10	as the Market Street Masonry Historic District contains a number of structures having a special
11	character and special historical, architectural and aesthetic interest and value, and constitutes a
12	distinct section of the City. The Board of Supervisors further finds that designation of said area as a
13	Historic District will be in furtherance of and in conformance with the purposes of Article 10 of the
14	Planning Code and the standards set forth therein, and that preservation on an area basis rather than
15	on the basis of individual structures alone is in order.
16	This ordinance is intended to further the general purpose of historic preservation legislation
17	as set forth in Section 1001 of the Planning Code, to promote the health, safety and general welfare of
18	the public.
19	
20	SEC. 2. DESIGNATION.
21	Pursuant to Section 1004 of the Planning Code, the Market Street Masonry Historic District
22	is hereby designated as a Historic District, this designation having been duly recommended for
23	approval by Resolution No. 690 of the Historic Preservation Commission and comments transmitted
24	by the Planning Commission by Resolution No. 18707, which Resolutions are on file with the Clerk of

the Board of Supervisors under File No. 121004 and which Resolutions are incorporated herein and made part hereof as though fully set forth.

SEC. 3. LOCATION AND BOUNDARIES. The location and boundaries of the Market Street Masonry Historic District include the following eight (8) buildings and Assessor Parcel Numbers: 150 Franklin Street (Block and Lot No. 0834/012); 20 Franklin Street, aka 1580-1598 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 0836/010); 1649-1651 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 3504/001); 1657 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 3504/046); 1666-1668 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 0854/004); 1670-1680 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 0854/005); 1687 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 3504/040); and 1693-1695 Market Street (Block and Lot No. 3504/038); and shall be as designated on the Market Street Masonry Historic District Map, the original of which is on file with the Clerk of the Board of Supervisors in File No. 121004, which Map is hereby incorporated herein as though fully set forth.

13

# SEC. 4. RELATION TO PLANNING CODE AND THE PROVISIONS OF THE CHARTER OF THE CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO.

17

Article 10 of the Planning Code is the basic law governing historic preservation in the City and County of San Francisco. This ordinance, being a specific application of Article 10, is both subject to and in addition to the provisions thereof.

19

Except as may be specifically provided to the contrary in this ordinance, nothing in this ordinance shall supersede, impair or modify any Planning Code provisions applicable to property in the Market Street Masonry Historic District, including but not limited to existing and future regulations controlling uses, height, bulk, lot coverage, floor area ratio, required open space, off-street

23

24

25

Supervisors Kim, Breed, Campos **BOARD OF SUPERVISORS** 

parking and signs.

#### SEC. 5. STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE.

Eight architecturally significant buildings located between Franklin and Valencia Streets

comprise the Market Street Masonry Historic District. Highly regarded master architects such as

August Nordin, G. Albert Lansburgh, Conrad A. Meussdorffer, and George Applegarth worked in the

popular revival styles of the early 20th-century such as Classical Revival, Colonial Revival, and

Venetian Gothic Revival.

The architects utilized a formal three-part arrangement consisting of a base (often with a commercial storefront), main portion or column (often with residential floors), and decorative top with either a projecting cornice or decorative parapet. All buildings comprising this non-contiguous historic district are three to six stories tall and are fully built out, covering their entire lot. Most are mixed-use with commercial ground floor uses and residential above.

Built between 1911 and 1925, following the 1906 Earthquake and Fire, and responding to new building codes, they influenced the visual transition of San Francisco from a city of wood and brick, to one of brick veneer, concrete, and stucco. Projecting bay windows—a long-standing feature in San Francisco—visually reinforce the vertical emphasis, while increasing the light and air into the interior of many of the buildings. The buildings are executed in earthquake and fire-resistant materials with steel frames, reinforced concrete, brick, and galvanized metal ornament.

While each building is unique, they relate to each other as a group because of the period in which they were constructed, their high-style design, and fire-proof masonry construction. All of the buildings are well-preserved examples and retain character-defining features, such as elaborate metal cornices, pattern brickwork, historic storefronts with glass transom lights, bronze plate glass window frames and decorative bases.

Additional historic information may be found in the Market Street Masonry Historic District

Designation Report, which is hereby incorporated herein as though fully set forth. This document is on file at the Planning Department under Case No. 2011.0705L.

#### SEC. 6. SIGNIFICANCE OF INDIVIDUAL BUILDINGS TO THE LANDMARK DISTRICT.

A district is usually a single geographic area of contiguous historic properties; however, a district may also be composed of multiple definable significant resources separated by non-significant areas. The Market Street Masonry discontiguous district is composed of eight buildings on four blocks that are spatially discrete. The space between the buildings is not related to the significance of the district. While all buildings can be seen from the intersection of Market and Franklin Streets, the visual continuity is not a factor in the significance. Each of the eight discontiguous buildings are contributory to the Market Street Masonry Historic District.

An architectural description, building history and evaluation of each parcel within the Historic District is documented in the Market Street Masonry Historic District Designation Report and are hereby incorporated herein as though fully set forth. It is important to note that street address numbers are subject to change, and that the most reliable, official method for identifying a property within the Landmark District is to refer to it by its assigned Assessor Block and Lot number.

### SEC. 7. FEATURES OF THE DISTRICT AND EXISTING BUILDINGS.

The character-defining features of the Market Street Masonry Historic District include all exterior elevations, including rooflines, of each of the eight buildings. The following section describes in further detail character-defining features of the District and of individual buildings contained therein. Historic District designation is intended to protect and preserve these character-defining features.

(a) Overall Form, Continuity, Scale and Proportion. All buildings are built to the property lines, rise vertically without setbacks, and have flat roofs. Building height is within a three-to six story range, with one building at three stories, one at four, four at five stories, and two at six stories in

bulk, scale and proportion.

windows that are vertical in orientation; however, industrial steel sash is found, as are awning and casement sash. Buildings feature a symmetrical and regular pattern of windows with consistent

height. All buildings in the district retain their historic integrity. The buildings are consistent in height,

(b) Fenestration. Existing fenestration consists of predominantly double-hung, wood sash

dimensions along primary facades. Aside from some ground floor commercial storefronts, the size and shape of window openings have not been altered over time. Replacement window sash that were added

to buildings after the period of significance have not gained significance in their own right.

- (c) Materials and Finishes. Unpainted brick is the predominant cladding material found in five of the eight buildings in the district; however, painted stucco on concrete is found on three buildings in the district. Galvanized sheet iron is used extensively for decorative features and the cladding of projecting bay windows.
- (d) Architectural Details. There are no character-defining interior features or spaces included in this designation. The character-defining exterior features of the buildings are:
- (1) 150 Franklin Street. The significant historical and architectural features of 150

  Franklin Street are: five-story height and rectangular massing; scored concrete cladding on the raised basement and brick cladding on the upper stories; recessed main entrance with a concrete, segmental arch surround, marble steps, and glazed wood door with sidelights and transom; glass and metal framed curved marquise; fenestration pattern of recessed, semi-hexagonal bays, with double-hung wood sash windows set within galvanized metal surrounds that extend the full height of the building; Classical Revival decorative details, including a basement story separated from the upper stories by a band of Greek key ornament, metal architrave with beveled shield ornaments between the bays, a frieze with brick Flemish diagonal bond ornament, and a deeply projecting metal cornice with dentils, egg and dart molding, drop finials on the soffit, galvanized metal spandrel panels, and geometric fascia ornament with plaques set between the bays on the cornice fascia; and flat roof; as well as:

(3) 1649 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are: five-
story height and U-shaped massing; stucco and brick cladding; recessed entrance with glazed wood
door, sidelights and transom; wood sash mezzanine windows at several storefronts; distinctive upper
story fenestration pattern of modified Chicago-style windows with six- over-one light double-hung
wood sash windows separated by spandrel panels with inlaid brick designs; side windows angled to the
depth of the building wall; fifth story stucco cladding with an elaborate decorative scheme; slightly
arched fifth story window openings with Corinthian columns with embossed patterning on the shafts;
sills supported on molded brackets, and recessed panels between windows; a relief panel with a female
face surrounded by garlands at the left and right ends of the story; and a metal entablature with dentils
and a modillion cornice; as well as:

- All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
- Rectangular massing;
- Unpainted Flemish bond brick on Market, Brady and Stevenson Streets;
- Recessed residential entry with marble paneling and beveled divided lights;
- Glazed storefronts with wood divided-light transoms set within embossed metal frames;
- Painted stucco base on Market, Brady and Stevenson Streets;
- Historic six-over-one and nine-over-one wood double hung sash;
- Terra cotta ornament at the fifth floor; and
- Projecting metal cornice.
- (4) 1657 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are: fivestory height and rectangular massing; brick cladding; intact lattice transom at the former storefront; multi-story canted bays; approximately fifty percent of the original double-hung, wood-sash windows; paneled spandrels and projecting cornices at the bays; a distinctive fifth story fenestration pattern including a pair of arched window openings with double-hung, wood sash in the left and right bays,

21

22

23

(6) 1670-1680 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are:
six-story height and massing; stucco cladding; storefronts with tiled water tables and window
enframements and original wood frame storefront windows and high, divided, straight, transom with
arched openings and turned spindle muntins; entry with shouldered, arched opening and a door hood
on brackets with a shouldered pediment; upper stories with bay windows in the second, fourth, and
sixth bays with paneled spandrels, colonnettes with spiral fluting, and molded friezes; and entablature
with molded medallion frieze and modillion cornice; as well as:
• All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
• Trapezoidal massing:
• Recessed residential entry with marble step, tiled floor, and wood entry door and transom
with wrought iron grilles;
• Glazed storefronts with wooden arched top divided light storefront transoms, tiled piers and
bases and retractable awning pockets;
• "Gaffney Building" incised panel above the storefronts;
• Historic wood casement windows with transoms; and
• Projecting metal cornice.
(7) 1687 Market Street. The significant historical and architectural features are identified
as follows: two-story with mezzanine / three-story height and massing; stucco cladding; glazed
storefronts; deeply recessed entry with tiled floor; wood entry doors with transoms; steel windows with
divided-light transoms; stucco moldings framing the façade and between the mezzanine and upper
floor; metal tile pent roof and shaped parapet on Market Street; and three levels of industrial divided-

- All exterior elevations, architectural details, motifs and rooflines;
- Rectangular massing;

<u>light steel sash on Stevenson Street; as well as:</u>

• Deeply recessed entry with tile floor, mirror, two wood doors and transoms;

(f) Additional features of the Historic District are documented in the Market Street
Masonry Historic District Designation Report within the section entitled "Common Characteristics o
Buildings in the Market Street Masonry District," and are hereby incorporated herein as though fully
set forth, and are on file at the Planning Department under Case No. 2011.0705L.

#### SEC. 8. REVIEW STANDARDS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

The standards for review of all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness are as set forth in Section 1006.6 of Article 10. For the purposes of review under those standards, the "character of the Historic District" shall mean the exterior architectural features of the Market Street Masonry Historic District referred to and described in Section 7 of this Appendix.

The procedures, requirements, controls, and standards in Sections 1005 through 1006.7 of the Planning Code shall apply to all applications for Certificates of Appropriateness in the Market Street Masonry Historic District. In addition to those requirements, the following provisions shall apply to all such applications; in the event of any conflict or inconsistency between the following provisions and Article 10, those procedures, requirements, controls and standards affording stricter protection to landmarks, landmark sites and the Historic District shall prevail:

- (a) A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for painting previously unpainted brickwork.
  - (b) Administrative Certificates of Appropriateness:
- (1) Brickwork: An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for cleaning brick surfaces with abrasives or treatment of such surfaces with waterproofing chemicals or anti-graffiti coatings.
- (2) Galvanized Metal Ornament: An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for any repair of metal ornament that necessitates its removal from the building in order to carry out such repair.

- (ix) For masonry buildings, projecting signs shall be anchored through mortar joints or attached to a non-historic storefront system. All other signs shall be attached in a manner that allows for their removal without adversely impacting the exterior of the subject building.
- (4) Exterior lighting. An Administrative Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for lighting systems, not otherwise defined as a sign by this Code, whether mounted on the façade of the building or not, the purpose of which is to illuminate the architectural features of the building.

Section 3. Effective Date. This ordinance shall become effective 30 days from the date of passage.

Section 4. In enacting this Ordinance, the Board intends to amend only those words, phrases, paragraphs, subsections, sections, articles, numbers, punctuation, charts, diagrams, or any other constituent part of the Planning Code that are explicitly shown in this legislation as additions, deletions, Board amendment additions, and Board amendment deletions in accordance with the "Note" that appears under the official title of the legislation.

APPROVED AS TO FORM: DENNIS J. HERRERA, City Attorney

By:

MARLENA G. BYRNE Deputy City Attorney



## City and County of San Francisco **Tails**

City Hall 1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place San Francisco, CA 94102-4689

#### **Ordinance**

**File Number:** 

121004

Date Passed: April 09, 2013

Ordinance amending the Planning Code, by adding a new Appendix M to Article 10 (Preservation of Historical, Architectural, and Aesthetic Landmarks), to create the Market Street Masonry Historic District, a discontiguous landmark historic district; and making findings, including environmental findings, and findings of consistency with the General Plan, and Planning Code, Section 101.1(b).

March 25, 2013 Land Use and Economic Development Committee - RECOMMENDED

April 02, 2013 Board of Supervisors - PASSED, ON FIRST READING

Ayes: 11 - Avalos, Breed, Campos, Chiu, Cohen, Farrell, Kim, Mar, Tang, Wiener and Yee

April 09, 2013 Board of Supervisors - FINALLY PASSED

Ayes: 11 - Avalos, Breed, Campos, Chiu, Cohen, Farrell, Kim, Mar, Tang, Wiener and Yee

File No. 121004

I hereby certify that the foregoing Ordinance was FINALLY PASSED on 4/9/2013 by the Board of Supervisors of the City and County of San Francisco.

> Angela Calvillo Clerk of the Board

**Date Approved**